



**HOCKING  
HERITAGE +  
ARCHITECTURE**

30 March 2023

City of Vincent  
mail@vincent.wa.gov.au

for the attention of Planning Services

Dear Sirs

**Amended development application  
Minor design modifications to approved additions to existing single house  
26 Moir Street, Perth  
City of Vincent Reference 5.2020.452.1  
Heritage comment**

The owners of the above property have commissioned an assessment of the impacts of the proposed changes to the approved development approval will have on the heritage significance of no. 26 Moir Street and the heritage precinct of which it forms part.

As the changes are minor, a full heritage impact statement is not being prepared in this instance however, the format of this assessment will follow the guidelines established by Heritage Council for preparing heritage impact statements.

**Brookman and Moir Streets Precinct**

The property forms part of the State Registered Brookman and Moir Streets Precinct in Perth. The Statement of Significance attributed to the place is as follows:

*Brookman and Moir Streets Precinct, two streets in Perth comprising 58 semi-detached residences and one detached residence in two types of Federation Queen Anne style, constructed of limestone and brick with corrugated iron roofs in 1897-98, and a shop at the corner of Moir Street and Forbes Road built in 1940, has cultural heritage significance for the following reasons:*

- *The historic precinct is an almost complete example of two late 19<sup>th</sup> century streets of modestly scaled residential buildings in the Federation Queen Anne style of architecture, built between 1897-98 in the wake of the rapid population expansion following the Western Australian gold boom;*
- *The historic precinct is a substantial section of the residential estate developed by the Colonial Finance Corporation in 1897-1898. This estate, comprising the historic precinct in Brookman and Moir Streets, and Baker's Terrace in Lake Street, was the largest estate of its type developed in Western Australia;*
- *The historic precinct is rare in Western Australia as two streets in which a single basic design was utilised for all the residences in a large estate, with the exception of Numbers 2 and 4 Brookman Street, which are grander variations of the same pattern used throughout the precinct, that is relatively intact;*



- The buildings contained within the precinct are representative of what was considered to be 'working class' rental accommodation from the late-19<sup>th</sup> and early-20<sup>th</sup> centuries;
- The one-way thoroughfares and modest lot sizes of the semi-detached dwellings contained within the precinct give it a particular character and sense of enclosure;
- The homogeneity of the modestly-scaled, semi-detached residential buildings creates a visually striking precinct in an inner city residential area; and
- The historic precinct was developed by the Colonial Finance Corporation who named Brookman and Moir Streets after two of the principal investors in the company who were prominent in Western Australia.

No. 26 Moir Street is located on the east side, at the northern end of Moir Street, close to the intersection with Robinson Street.

#### **Amended details**

The changes being discussed in this heritage impact assessment are:

<b>Materials</b>		
<b>Location</b>	<b>Approved materials</b>	<b>Proposed materials</b>
Rear elevation	Wall: Masonry render to entire wall Paint finish White	Upper section – Weather Tex cladding 'Weathergroove' 150mm Paint or natural finish
	Window frames – aluminium mat black	Lower section – face brick Midland 'Subiaco Red' No change
South elevation	Roof: corrugated sheet cladding to match existing	Lysaght Longline 305 colorbond in Shale Grey
	Wall: Face brick – colour to match existing	Face brick Midland Brick 'Subiaco Red'
North elevation	Window frames – aluminium mat black	No change
	Wall: Upper section – face brick to match existing brickwork Lower section – boundary wall as per neighbour requirements	Upper section – Weather Tex cladding 'Weathergroove' 150mm Paint or natural finish Lower section – boundary wall where visible to the neighbour –



		face brick Midland 'Subiaco Red' face brick or painted as per neighbour requirements
	Window frames – aluminium mat black	No change
<b>Change in dimensions to addition</b>		
	Approved length of addition: 8.280m	Proposed length of addition: 7.930m, a reduction of 0.350m
<b>Change to window detail</b>		
	Metal window shroud to rear elevation	Removal of shroud, replaced with obscured glazing to the opening

### **Assessment of heritage impact**

The original heritage impact statement prepared in September 2021 concluded that the two storey addition to the rear of No. 26 Moir Street would not harm the heritage significance of the individual property nor the special qualities of the heritage precinct as a whole. The report concluded that the scale and material palette for the addition were in keeping with the scale of the original houses and would not detract from the homogeneity of the architectural form that defines Moir Street. The proposed changes to the approved development proposal seek emulate the above outcome and will not harm the heritage significance of the individual house or the heritage precinct as a whole.

City of Vincent Heritage Policy 7.6.1 Heritage Management – Development Guidelines for Heritage and Adjacent Properties establishes objectives for development of heritage places (or adjacent to heritage places) to ensure that the documented significance of such places is not harmed through inappropriate change and development.

The policy requires that alterations and additions to places of heritage significance should be respectful and be compatible with existing fabric. Any addition should ensure :

- that it does not alter the original façade or roof pitch;
- should be clearly distinguishable from the original building;
- be based on research that can identify the elements, detailing and finishes already used;
- does not obscure important elements of the original building;
- maintain existing views to the principal facades of the heritage place;
- are positioned and sized to ensure that the prominence of significant elements are retained;
- that an upper storey is sited and massed behind the main façade so that it is not visible from the street;
- openings in the principal façade of the addition should not be seen from the street or should be proportionally related to those in the heritage building.

The proposed changes to the approved addition are all in keeping with the above objectives of the heritage policy. The proposed changes are minimal and do not seek to increase the scale or massing of the addition.

The 350mm reduction in length is a positive change, reducing the overall size of the addition. The original dimensions of the addition were considered appropriate and would not over-dominate the single storey heritage house therefore, the proposed reduction in length will result in the same outcome and will not harm any streetscape views or result in a loss of original significant detail/fabric of the principal facades.



**HOCKING  
HERITAGE +  
ARCHITECTURE**

The change in materials will also have minimal impact on the heritage significance of the place or heritage area.

The material palette of additions and alterations is to be informed by the original building. The original house is of red brick construction with rendered bands and corrugated iron roof. The proposed 'Subiaco Red' bricks complement the existing brickwork whilst creating a slight distinction allowing the new work to be clearly distinguishable from the existing, as per policy requirements.

The Lysaght Longline 305 cladding to the roof on the south side of the addition will create a slightly different aesthetic to the corrugated sheet cladding that was proposed in the original DA. The change in the material will add to the contemporary nature of the design of the addition and will result in an interpretation of the traditional 'brick and iron' house. The wider profile of the corrugations in the proposed cladding will not harm any of the documented values of the heritage area.

The change from brickwork to Weather Tex cladding Weathergroove 150mm will likewise have a minimal impact on the heritage significance of the house and heritage area. The proposed material presents with vertical pattern emulating timber planks and will create a lighter aesthetic to the upper sections of the addition than the original brickwork that was approved. The contemporary design of the addition calls for a palette of materials that is informed by the materials of the original building stock of the area whilst allowing for the introduction of materials that are not regarded as being traditional but complement the original materials palette. The proposed material complements the existing material palette of the original house and is considered an appropriate change.

The removal of the window shroud to the rear elevation will not have any impact on the heritage values of the area nor have a detrimental impact on the design of the addition.

## **Conclusion**

In summary, the proposed changes to the approved development application will not harm the heritage significance of No. 26 Moir Street or the Brookman and Moir Streets Precinct.

As concluded in the original heritage impact statement, the proposed development is in keeping with the heritage policy adopted by City of Vincent. The proposed development also does not impact adversely on any of the value statements that form the adopted statement of significance associated with the entry of the precinct onto the State Register of Heritage Places.

The development retains a significant house in a significant streetscape and precinct. The addition to the rear of No. 26 Moir Street is of a complementary contemporary style that has taken some design influence from the original house in terms of material palette and colours. As previously concluded, the addition is of appropriate scale and massing and will not dominate the original house or have an adverse impact on the significance of the area. The slight reduction to the size of the approved addition reinforces this conclusion.

The architectural expression of the new addition is refined and simple and does not seek to mimic any of the essential design characteristics of the original house. Whereas the original part of the house is a reflection of traditional architectural styles demonstrating a simpler way of life around the turn of the century, the addition is a reflection of modern architectural standards and clearly demonstrates how the new can sit comfortably with the old. The proposed change in some of the materials contributes to this narrative and will not impact negatively on the heritage precinct.



**HOCKING  
HERITAGE +  
ARCHITECTURE**

Yours faithfully

**Gemma Dewar**  
**Managing Director**